

CITY OF SANTA CLARA



**HISTORICAL AND LANDMARKS COMMISSION
MEETING**

**August 2, 2007 - Thursday
City Manager's Staff Conference Room
1500 Warburton Avenue, Santa Clara**

*****MINUTES*****

7:00 P.M.

ITEMS FOR COUNCIL ACTION

NONE

- I. Call to Order
Chairperson Richards called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

- II. Roll Call
Commissioners: Boynton, Marinshaw, McKee, Patton, Petersen, Richards and Wilson

Architectural Advisor Craig Mineweaser, AIA sent written comments regarding the three architectural items.

Staff Present: Judith Silva, Associate Planner/HLC Staff Liaison

Guests Present: Joan Cabral, Erumena Otovo, Chris Leahy, Stephen Finhill, Scott Grasmoen, Rob Meyer and Don Arnoldy.

- III. Requests for withdrawals and continuances without a hearing
There were none.

- IV. Approval of Minutes
A. HLC Meeting Minutes of June 7, 2007
It was moved by Commissioner Wilson, seconded by Commissioner Marinshaw and carried to approve the minutes of June 7, 2007 as corrected.

- V. Items on this Agenda Requiring Council Action
The following items may be heard by the City Council upon a recommendation by the Historical and Landmarks Commission:
None
- VI. Council and Planning Commission Actions Pertaining to the Historical and Landmarks Commission (Discussion as Needed)
Ms. Silva reviewed items of interest for the Commission from Planning Commission and City Council meetings.
- VII. Correspondence/Announcements
A. General Correspondence Distributed in Commission Packet
Ms. Silva advised those present that Volunteer Architectural Advisor, Craig Mineweaser AIA had sent written comments which would be distributed and reviewed during discussion of the three architectural items.
- VIII. Public Presentations

Jeanne Snyder addressed the Commission and stated she wished to revise her 10-year plan on her Mills Act. Ms. Snyder was directed to give staff her revisions and writing for review since the item was not agendaized.
- IX. New Business
A. Election of Historical & Landmarks Commission Officers – July 2007- June 2008
Commissioner Petersen stated his preference was to rotate officers and not have an elections.

It was moved by Commissioner Wilson, seconded by Commissioner Petersen and unanimously carried to appoint Commissioner McKee as Chairperson.

It was then moved from Commissioner Richards, seconded by Commissioner Petersen to appoint Commissioner Wilson as Vice-Chairperson. Motion carried with Commissioner Patton dissenting and voting for Commissioner Marinshaw.

Newly appointed Chairperson McKee then took position at the helm.
- B. Adoption of Historical and Landmarks Commission Meeting Calendar for 2008
It was moved by Commissioner Richards, seconded by Commissioner Petersen and unanimously carried to adopt the Historical and Landmarks Commission Meeting Calendar for 2008, as presented by staff.
- C. Request for Demolition of Existing Single Family Residence and Construction of Two New Single Family Residences with Detached Residential Accessory Structures, in conjunction with a subdivision application – 1550 Fremont Street (PLN2007-06336).
Ms. Silva reviewed the request to demolish the c.1940s ranch style structure, splitting the one lot into two lots and for the construction of two new single family residences with detached garages and residential accessory units above. She noted a Historic and Architectural Evaluation had been prepared for the property and

the survey found the house and property as not appearing to be historically significant according to the criteria of the California register of Historical Resources.

Rob Mayer, applicant and architect for the owner, addressed the Commission. He stated there are many 50 foot wide lots in the Old Quad and that they wished to mimic the two twin houses on Monroe at Lexington Street.

The owner, Scott Grasmoe, then addressed the Commission. In response to a question from Commissioner Marinshaw, Mr. Grasmoe declined to answer if he resided in the residence.

Commissioner Richards stated this block face was intact with 1940s style ranch homes. He then stated that he was opposed to the demolition and felt the historic survey was flawed as there is historic merit to the continuity of the block and streetscape. Commissioners Petersen, Wilson and Chairperson McKee reiterated Commissioner Richards concerns while noting there were no two-story structure is the immediate neighborhood.

Craig Mineweaser, AIA comments were then reviewed for the Commission and those present (attached).

Motion: It was moved by Commissioner Boynton, seconded by Commissioner Wilson and unanimously carried to **recommend Planning Commission denial of the** request to demolish the existing ranch-style residence, split the lot and for the construction of two single family residences with residential accessory units.

Ms. Silva advised those present that minutes with the Historical and Landmarks recommendation would be forwarded to the Planning Commission for the August 22, 2007 meeting.

- D. Request for 1st and 2nd Story Expansion, and for demolition of detached garage – 4262 Davis Street (Architecturally/Significant Property) (PLN2007-06505).
Ms. Silva reviewed the request noting that a variance was required for a decreased side yard setback, increase in building height, substandard 2-car garage; and architectural review for a 6-bedroom/8-bathroom residence to a significant property. She noted that staff did not support the request as it was felt the proposal is not compatible with the Secretary of the Interior Standards or the City's Architectural Design Guidelines for the building in terms of massing, scale and relationship to surrounding properties and was recommending denial of the project.
Comments from Craig Mineweaser, AIA were then reviewed. Mr. Mineweaser's comments reiterated staff's concerns of massiveness and that the proposal does not comply with the Secretary of the Interiors Standards or the City's Design Guidelines and supported staff's recommendation of denial.

Mr. Otovo, owner, then addressed the Commission. He stated he has 11 children, numerous vehicles and needed the room. He noted his previous approval for a 3-car garage was never built.

Commissioner Richards stated that the request involved a land use decision and was not based on personal needs, while noting this proposal would remove an of the historic integrity of the structure due to the immense size. Commissioner Petersen stated his concerns were the same as Commissioner Richards.

Motion: It was moved by Commissioner Richards, seconded by Commissioner Petersen and carried (Commissioner Patton dissenting) to recommend Planning Commission **denial of the Variance** for a decrease in building setback, an increase in building height, substandard 2-car garage; as well as the **Architectural Review** for a 6-bedroom/8-bathroom residence to a historic property due to the overwhelming size and loss of integrity to the historic structure.

Ms. Silva noted this would be a recommendation to Planning Commission.

E. Request for Variance for Increased Building Height and Increased Building Coverage – 1253 Market Street (PLN2007-06463).

Ms. Silva reviewed the request for variance to increase the detached accessory floor area from 480 square feet to 731 square feet, and increase of building height to 21 feet 5 inches in conjunction with the demolition of the existing detached garage and the construction of a detached garage with a residential accessory dwelling unit above. She noted staff was supporting the request as the proposal is compatible with the Secretary of the Interior Standards and City's Architectural Design Guidelines for the building in terms of massing, scale and relationship to surrounding properties and **recommends approval** of the project design, subject to conditions.

Mr. Mineweaser's comments regarding the request were then reviewed by the Commission. Mr. Mineweaser, A.I.A. noted he felt the addition was compatible with the Secretary's Standards and City's Design Guidelines and that it would be a nice fit for the neighborhood.

Chris Leahy, owner, addressed the Commission. He stated he has a large truck and trailer he wished to house in the proposed garage and requested the staff's Condition #3 be removed (adding brackets) as he felt it was detach and make the placement of the windows difficult.

Motion: It was moved by Commissioner Richards, seconded by Commissioner Wilson and unanimously carried to recommend Planning Commission approval of the request and that Condition #3 be removed from the HLC staff report.

Commissioner Richards then recommended the owner to look into having a DPR (historic survey) prepared for the property prior to the final inspection.

Ms. Silva noted the Commission's recommendation would be forwarded to the Planning Commission for the public hearing on August 22, 2007.

- X. Old Business, Referrals and Continued Items
 - A. Mills Act Criteria – Exterior and Interior Changes, Additions, Inspections and other
Staff was requested to bring a summary of previous minutes, information related to Mills Act Contracts.

- XI. Commissioner/Committee Reports
 - A. Santa Clara Arts and Historic Consortium (McKee)
[Fourth Monday of each month at 7:15 p.m. - Headen-Inman House]
Chairperson McKee noted there would not be a meeting until September.

 - B. Historic Preservation Society of Santa Clara (Richards/Marinshaw alternate)
[Second Friday of each month at 10:00 a.m.- Harris Lass Preserve]
Commissioner Marinshaw stated there had been two recent articles in the Santa Clara Weekly and felt the publicity was helping as their turnouts had been very successful. She then noted there would be a bicycle tour on Labor Day.

 - C. Old Quad Residents Association (Richards/McKee alternate)
There was no report or meeting.

 - D. Neighborhood University Relations (Petersen)
There was no report.

 - E. Architectural Committee (Marinshaw/Patton)
Commissioner Marinshaw stated she had attended the meeting, but there were no historic items under review.

 - F. Agnews Historic Cemetery Museum Committee (Wilson and Patton)
Commissioner Wilson stated she would visit the site before the next meeting.

 - G. BART Committee (Marinshaw)
Commissioner Marinshaw noted there had not been a meeting since her last report.

- XII. Items Considered, Time Permitting
None

- XIII. A. Commission Budget for 2007-08

- XIV. Pending Agenda Items (notice of upcoming agenda items only- No discussion)
 - A. Commemorative plaque for the Verein (this item has been forwarded to Santa Clara University). Joe Sugg/SCU to install plaque when construction is completed, est. date Fall 2007).
Ms. Silva reported that the commemorative plaque for the Verein has been installed and is located within the front landscape area at the southwest corner of Alviso and Benton Streets.
 - B. Commissioner Training
 - C. Further updates on Harris-Lass Preserve

D. BART Station Design Workshop Notice

XV. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted:

Approved:

Judith Silva
Associate Planner/HLC Staff Liaison

Gloria Sciara, AICP
Development Review Officer

I:\PLANNING\2007\HLC 2007\0802\minutes 080207.doc